## UDC 515.12

A. K. Mirmostafaee (Ferdowsi Univ. Mashhad, Iran)

## РОІNTS OF UPPER AND LOWER SEMICONTINUITY OF MULTIVALUED FUNCTIONS\* ТОЧКИ ВЕРХНЬОЇ ТА НИЖНЬОЇ НАПІВНЕПЕРЕРВНОСТІ ДЛЯ БАГАТОЗНАЧНИХ ФУНКЦІЙ

We investigate joint upper and lower semicontinuity of two-variable set-valued functions. More precisely, among other results, we show that, under certain conditions, a two-variable lower horizontally quasicontinuous mapping  $F: X \times Y \rightarrow \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is jointly upper semicontinuous on sets of the from  $D \times \{y_0\}$ , where D is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset of X and  $y_0 \in Y$ . A similar result is obtained for the joint lower semicontinuity of upper horizontally quasicontinuous mappings. These results improve some known results on the joint continuity of single-valued functions.

Вивчається спільна верхня та нижня напівнеперервність для багатозначних функцій двох змінних. Більш точно, серед інших результатів показано, що за деяких умов нижньо горизонтально квазінеперервне відображення від двох змінних  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  є спільно верхньо напівнеперервним на множинах з  $D \times \{y_0\}$ , де D — щільна  $G_{\delta}$  підмножина X та  $y_0 \in Y$ . Подібний результат отримано також для спільної нижньої напівнеперервності верхньо горизонтальних квазінеперервних відображень. Ці результати покращують деякі відомі результати про спільну неперервність однозначних функцій.

**1. Introduction and preliminaries.** Throughout the paper, we will assume that all topological spaces are  $T_1$ . For a topological space Z, we denote by  $\mathcal{P}(Z)$ ,  $\mathcal{C}(Z)$  and  $\mathcal{K}(Z)$  the set of all nonempty subsets, the set of all nonempty closed subsets and the set of all nonempty compact subsets of Z respectively. If  $F: X \to \mathcal{P}(Z)$  is a set-valued function. For a subset G of Z, we define  $F^+(G)$  and  $F^-(G)$  as follows:

$$F^+(G) = \{ x \in X : F(x) \subseteq G \}, \qquad F^-(G) = \{ x \in X : F(x) \cap G \neq \emptyset \}.$$

The function F is called:

(a) upper (resp. lower) semicontinuous if for every open subset G of Z,  $F^+(G)$  (resp.  $F^-(G)$ ) is an open subset of X.

(b) upper (resp. lower) quasicontinuous at  $x_0 \in X$  if for any open set G, with  $x_0 \in F^+(G)$ (resp.  $x_0 \in F^-(G)$ ) and any neighborhood U of  $x_0$ , there exists a nonempty open set  $V \subseteq U$  such that  $V \subseteq F^+(G)$  (resp.  $V \subseteq F^-(G)$ ).

(c) categorically upper (resp. lower) quasicontinuous at  $x_0 \in X$ , if for each neighborhood U of  $x_0$  and neighborhood G containing  $F(x_0)$ , there exists a set  $A \subseteq U$  of the second category such that  $F(a) \subseteq G$  (resp.  $F(a) \cap G \neq \emptyset$ ) for all  $a \in A$ .

Let Z be a topological space and  $\{\mathcal{G}_n\}$  be a sequence of open covers of Z. For every  $z \in Z$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , let  $St(z, \mathcal{G}_n) = \bigcup \{G \in \mathcal{G}_n : z \in \mathcal{G}_n\}$ . The sequence  $\{\mathcal{G}_n\}$  is called:

(a) A development, if for every  $z \in Z$ , the sequence  $\{St(z, \mathcal{G}_n)\}\$  is a base at z. A space with a developable space is called a developable space. A regular developable space is called a Moore space.

<sup>\*</sup> This paper was supported by Ferdowsi University of Mashhad (Grant No. 2/42133).

<sup>©</sup> A. K. MIRMOSTAFAEE, 2017

(b) A weak k-development if for every compact subset  $K \subset Z$  and  $\{\mathcal{H}_n\}$  such that for every  $n, \mathcal{H}_n \subseteq \mathcal{G}_n, \mathcal{H}_n$  is finite,  $K \cap H \neq \emptyset$  for every  $H \in \mathcal{H}_n$  and  $K \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}_n$ , we have that the sequence  $\{\bigcap_{i \leq n} (\bigcup \mathcal{H}_i)\}$  is a base at K. A space with a weak k-development is called a *weakly* k-developable space.

We refer the reader to [1] for more information about k-developable topological spaces.

The aim of this paper is to obtain points of joint upper and lower semicontinuity of two variable set-valued functions. One of the first results in this direction is the following.

**Theorem 1.1** [4]. Let X be a Baire space, Y a second countable space, Z be a metrizable space and  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  be a compact-valued mapping which is lower semicontinuous with respect to the first variable and upper semicontinuous with respect to the second variable. Then there exists a dense in X  $G_{\delta}$ -set  $A \subseteq X$  such that F is jointly upper semicontinuous at every point of the set  $A \times Y$ .

Let X and Y be topological spaces and let  $f: X \to Y$  be a function. The function f is called quasicontinuous if for each  $x \in X$  and neighborhoods U of x and V of f(y), there is a nonempty open subset U' of U such that  $f(U') \subseteq V$ .

The notion of quasicontinuity turned out to be a useful tool in some mathematical problems (see, e.g., [2, 3, 10, 12, 13, 17, 18, 20, 21]).

In 1975, V. Popa [22] generalized the notion of quasicontinuity for set-valued functions. Since then, some authors investigated various types of continuity of set-valued functions [5-9].

A function  $f: X \times Y \to Z$  is said to be *horizontally quasicontinuous* at  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$  if for any neighborhoods U, V and W of x, y and f(x, y) respectively, there is a nonempty open subset  $U' \subset$  of X and  $y' \in V$  such that  $f(U' \times \{y'\}) \subseteq W$ . In [14–16] some properties of horizontally quasicontinuous functions are investigated. In Section 2, we will define upper and lower horizontal quasicontinuity for two-variable set-valued functions. We will show that if F is a lower horizontally quasicontinuous function,  $F_x: Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is upper semicontinuous and  $F^y:$  $X \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is categorically upper quasicontinuous for each  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$ . Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is jointly upper semicontinuous on  $D \times \{y_0\}$  provided that X is Baire,  $y_0 \in Y$  has a countable base and Z is a normal weakly k-developable space.

Finally, in Section 3, we will investigate lower semicontinuity of a two variable set-valued function  $F: X \times Y \to C(Z)$ . In fact, by using a different method from what we used in Section 2, we will prove a similar result for upper horizontally quasicontinuous functions. In fact, we will show that if  $F: X \times Y \to C(Z)$  is an upper horizontally quasicontinuous function such that  $F_x:$  $Y \to C(Z)$  is lower semicontinuous and  $F^y: X \to C(Z)$  is categorically lower quasicontinuous for each  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$ . Then F is symmetrically lower quasicontinuous at each point of  $X \times \{y_0\}$ provided that X is Baire,  $y_0 \in Y$  has a countable base and Z is regular. Our results can be considered as generalizations of corresponding results in [5, 11, 15, 16].

2. Upper semicontinuity of two variable set-valued functions. In this section, we will show that under some circumstances, a two-variable function set-valued function  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$ , for each  $y_0 \in Y$ , is jointly upper-semicontinuous on a set of the form  $D \times \{y_0\}$ , where D is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset of X.

We begin with the following definitions.

**Definition 2.1.** Let  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{P}(Z)$  be a function and  $(x_0, y_0) \in X \times Y$ . The function F is called:

(a) symmetrically upper (resp. lower) quasicontinuous at  $(x_0, y_0)$  with respect to the second variable if for each nonempty open subset W of Z with  $(x_0, y_0) \in F^+(W)$  (resp.  $(x_0, y_0) \in F^-(W)$ ) and a neighborhood U of  $x_0$ , there are a nonempty open subset U' of U and a neighborhood V of  $y_0$  such that  $U' \times V \subseteq F^+(W)$  (resp.  $U' \times V \subseteq F^-(W)$ );

(b) upper (resp. lower) horizontally quasicontinuous at  $(x_0, y_0)$  if whenever U, V and W are open subsets X, Y and Z respectively with  $(x_0, y_0) \in U \times V$  and  $(x_0, y_0) \in F^+(W)$  (resp.  $(x_0, y_0) \in F^-(W)$ ), there are a nonempty open subset U' of U and  $y' \in V$  such that  $(x, y') \in F^+(W)$  (resp.  $(x, y') \in F^-(W)$ ) for each  $x \in U'$ .

Now, we are ready to state one of the main results of this section.

**Theorem 2.1.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a space and Z a space with a weakly k-development. Let  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  be symmetrically upper quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable at each point of  $X \times \{y_0\}$  for some  $y_0 \in Y$ . Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is jointly upper semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** Let  $\{\mathcal{G}_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a k-weak development for Z. For each natural number n, let  $D_n$  be the set of all  $x \in X$  such that for some finite subset  $\mathcal{H}$  of  $\mathcal{G}_n$  and neighborhoods U of x, V of  $y_0$  respectively, we have  $U \times V \subseteq F^+(\bigcup \mathcal{H})$  and  $F(t, y_0) \cap H \neq \emptyset$  for each  $H \in \mathcal{H}$  and  $t \in U$ .

By the definition, each  $D_n$  is open in X. We will show that each  $D_n$  is dense in X. Let n be a fixed natural number and U be a nonempty open subset of X.

We say that the property  $p(k), k \in \mathbb{N}$ , holds if the following statement is true.

If there is a nonempty open subset U' of U such that  $F(U', y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}$ , where  $\mathcal{H} \subseteq \mathcal{G}_n$  with  $|\mathcal{H}| \leq k$ , then  $D_n$  contains a nonempty open subset of U.

Let U' be a nonempty open subset of U such that  $F(U', y_0) \subseteq H$  for some  $H \in \mathcal{G}_n$ . By upper symmetrical quasicontinuity of F on  $U' \times \{y_0\}$ , we can find a nonempty open subset U'' of U' and a neighborhood V of  $y_0$  such that  $F(x, y) \subseteq H$  for each  $(x, y) \in U'' \times V$ . Therefore  $U'' \subseteq D_n$ . Thus p(1) is true.

Let p(k) hold for some k and U' be a nonempty open subset of U such that  $F(U', y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}$ for some subset  $\mathcal{H}$  of  $\mathcal{G}_n$  with  $|\mathcal{H}| = k + 1$ . If for some  $x_0 \in U'$ , there is a proper subset of  $\mathcal{H}$ , say  $\mathcal{H}'$ , such that  $F(x_0, y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}'$ , then  $|\mathcal{H}'| \leq k$  and by symmetrically upper quasicontinuity of F, we can find a nonempty open subset U'' of U' such that  $F(U'', y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}'$ . Therefore, by our hypothesis,  $D_n$  contains a nonempty open subset of U. So that we may assume that  $\mathcal{H}$  has exactly k + 1 elements say  $H_1, \ldots, H_{k+1}$  and  $F(x, y_0) \cap H_i \neq \emptyset$  for each  $x \in U'$  and  $1 \leq i \leq k + 1$ . By symmetrical upper quasicontinuity of F on  $U' \times \{y_0\}$ , we can find a nonempty open subset U'' of U' and a neighborhoods V of  $y_0$  such that  $F(U'', V) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}$ . Then

$$F(U'' \times V) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}, \qquad F(x, y_0) \cap H_i \neq \emptyset \quad \forall x \in U''.$$

Therefore  $U'' \subseteq D_n$ . Hence p(k) holds for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Now, if  $x \in U$  and  $F(x, y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}$ , where  $\mathcal{H}$  is a finite subset of  $\mathcal{G}_n$ . By symmetrically upper quasicontinuity of F at  $(x, y_0)$ , there is a nonempty open subset U' of U and a neighborhood Vof  $y_0$  such that  $F(U' \times V) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}$ . According to p(k), where  $k = |\mathcal{H}|$ , the set  $D_n$  contains a nonempty subset of U. This shows that  $D_n$  is dense in X. Let  $D = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} D_n$ . Let  $x \in D$  and Wbe an open subset of Z with  $F(x, y_0) \subseteq W$ . By the definition of the sets  $D_n$ , for each n, there are neighborhoods  $U_n$  of x and  $V_n$  of  $y_0$  and a finite subset  $\mathcal{H}_n$  of  $\mathcal{G}_n$  such that  $U_n \times V_n \subseteq F^+(\bigcup \mathcal{H}_n)$  and  $F(x, y_0) \cap H \neq \emptyset$  for each  $H \in \mathcal{H}_n$ . Since Z is weakly k-developable,  $\{\bigcap_{i \leq n} (\bigcup \mathcal{H}_i)\}$  is a base at  $F(x, y_0)$ . Hence there is some  $n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $\bigcap_{i \leq n_0} (\bigcup \mathcal{H}_i) \subseteq W$ . Therefore  $(\bigcap_{i \leq n_0} U_i) \times (\bigcap_{i \leq n_0} V_i) \subseteq F^+(W)$ . This proves upper semicontinuity of F at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

In order to obtain an application for Theorem 2.1, we need to the following axillary result.

**Lemma 2.1.** Let  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{P}(Z)$  be a lower horizontally quasicontinuous function. If U and V are open subsets of X and Y respectively such that  $U \subseteq \overline{A}$  for some subset A of X. Then  $F(U \times V) \subseteq \overline{F(A \times V)}$ .

**Proof.** Suppose that z is an arbitrary element of  $F(U \times V)$  and W is a neighborhood of z. Take some  $a \in U$  and  $b \in V$  such that  $z \in F(a, b)$ . By lower horizontal quasicontinuity of F, we can find some  $(a_1, b_1) \in U \times V$  and a neighborhood  $U_1$  of a such that  $U_1 \subseteq U$  and  $F(x, b_1) \cap W \neq \emptyset$  for all  $x \in U_1$ . Since  $U_1 \subseteq U \subseteq \overline{A}$ , we have  $U_1 \cap A \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $a_0$  be an element of  $U_1 \cap A$ , then

$$\emptyset \neq F(a_0, b_1) \cap W \subseteq F(A \times V) \cap W.$$

This means that  $z \in \overline{F(A \times V)}$ .

The following result gives a sufficient condition for symmetrically upper quasicontinuity of a lower horizontally quasicontinuous function.

**Theorem 2.2.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a space with a countable base at  $y_0 \in Y$  and Z a normal space. Let  $F: X \times Y \to C(Z)$  is a lower horizontally quasicontinuous function such that  $F_x: Y \to C(Z)$  is upper semicontinuous for each  $x \in X$  and  $F^{y_0}: X \to C(Z)$  is categorically upper quasicontinuous. Then F is symmetrically upper quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable at each point of  $X \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** Let  $x \in X$  and G be a neighborhood of x. Let  $F(x, y_0) \subseteq W$  for some open subset W of Z. By normality of Z, there is an open subset W' of W such that

$$F(x, y_0) \subseteq W' \subseteq \overline{W'} \subseteq W.$$

Since  $F^{y_0}: X \to \mathcal{C}(Z)$  is categorically upper quasicontinuous at x, there is a subset A of G such that A is of the second category in X and  $F(a, y_0) \subseteq W'$  for all  $a \in A$ .

Let  $\{V_n\}$  be a base of neighborhoods of  $y_0$ . Define

$$A_n = \{ a \in A : F_a(V_n) \subseteq W' \}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}.$$

It follows from upper semicontinuity of  $F_a: Y \to \mathcal{C}(Z)$  for each  $a \in A$  that  $A = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ . Since A is of the second category in X, there is some  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $U_m = (\overline{A_m})^\circ \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $U = G \cap U_m$ ,  $V = V_m$  and  $A_0 = A_m \cap U$ . Since  $U_m \subseteq \overline{A_m \cap U_m}$ , we have  $A_m \cap U_m \neq \emptyset$ . The relation

$$\emptyset \neq A_m \cap U_m \subseteq G \cap U_m = U$$

implies that U is a nonempty open subset of G. Since  $U \subseteq U \cap \overline{A_m} \subseteq \overline{A_0}$ , by Lemma 2.1,

$$F(U \times V) \subseteq F(A_0 \times V) \subseteq \overline{W'} \subseteq W$$

This proves that F is symmetrically upper quasicontinuous at  $(x, y_0)$ .

The following result follows immediately from Theorems 2.1 and 2.2.

**Theorem 2.3.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a space with countable base at  $y_0 \in Y$  and Z a normal weakly k-developable space. Let  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is a lower horizontally quasicontinuous function such that  $F_x: Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is upper semicontinuous for each  $x \in X$  and  $F^{y_0}: X \to \mathcal{C}(Z)$  is categorically upper quasicontinuous. Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is jointly upper semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

The following example shows that lower horizontal quasicontinuity of F in Theorem 2.3 is necessary.

**Example 2.1** ([19], Example 1). Let  $E = \{(p_n, q_n) : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a countable dense subset of  $\mathbb{R}^2$  such that if  $(p_n, q_n)$  and  $(p_m, q_m)$  are two distinct elements of E, then  $p_n \neq p_m$  and  $q_n \neq q_m$ . Define  $F : \mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathcal{K}(\mathbb{R})$  by

$$F(x,y) = \begin{cases} \{0\}, & (x,y) \notin E, \\ [0,n], & (x,y) = (p_n, q_n) \in E. \end{cases}$$

It is easy to see that all selection  $F_x$  and  $F^y$  are upper semicontinuous but F has no point of joint upper semicontinuity.

**3.** Lower semicontinuity of two variable set-valued functions. In this section, we discuss about conditions which imply joint lower semicontinuity of a set-valued function  $F: X \times Y \to C(Z)$  on a set  $D \times \{y_0\}$ , where D dense subset of X and  $y_0 \in Y$ .

**Theorem 3.1.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a space and Z be second countable. Let  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{P}(Z)$  is symmetrically lower quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable at each point of  $X \times \{y_0\}$  for some  $y_0 \in Y$ . Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is lower semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** Let  $\mathcal{W} = \{W_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a countable base for Z. Define

$$A_n = \left\{ x \in X : (x, y_0) \in F^-(W_n) \setminus \left(F^-(W_n)\right)^o \right\}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}.$$

Let  $D_n = X \setminus \overline{A}_n$  for each n and  $D = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} D_n$ . Since each  $D_n$  is an open subset of X, D is a  $G_{\delta}$  subset of X. We will show that  $D_n$  is dense in X for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Take some fixed  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ and a nonempty open subset U of X with  $\overline{A_n} \cap U \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $x \in A_n \cap U$ . By symmetrical lower quasicontinuity of F at  $(x, y_0)$ , there is a nonempty open subset U' of U and a neighborhood Vof  $y_0$  such that  $U' \times V \subseteq F^-(W_n)$ . Since U' is open  $\overline{A_n} \cap U' = \emptyset$ . Hence  $U' \subseteq U \cap D_n \neq \emptyset$ . Clearly F is jointly lower semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ . Let  $x \in D$  and W be an open subset of Z with  $F(x, y_0) \cap W \neq \emptyset$ . Then there is some natural number  $n_0$  such that  $W_{n_0} \subset W$  and  $F(x, y_0) \cap W_{n_0} \neq \emptyset$ . Since  $x \notin A_{n_0}$ , we have  $(x, y_0) \in (F^-(W_n))^o \subseteq (F^-(W))^o$ . This proves lower semicontinuity of F on  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

It is natural to ask when a set-valued two variable function is symmetrically lower semicontinuous? The following result gives a partial answer to this question.

**Theorem 3.2.** Let X be a Baire space, Y be a space with a countable base at  $y_0 \in Y$  and let Z be a regular space. Let  $F: X \times Y \to C(Z)$  is an upper horizontally quasicontinuous function such that  $F_x: Y \to C(Z)$  is lower semicontinuous at  $y_0$  for each  $x \in X$  and  $F^{y_0}:$  $X \to C(Z)$  is categorically lower quasicontinuous. Then F is symmetrically lower quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable at each point of  $X \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** Let for some  $x_0 \in X$ , F is not symmetrically lower quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable at  $(x_0, y_0)$ . Then there are open sets  $U \subset X$ ,  $V \subset Y$  and  $W \subset Z$  such that  $F(x_0, y_0) \cap W \neq \emptyset$  but for every nonempty open subset  $U' \subseteq U$  and neighborhood  $V' \subseteq V$  of  $y_0$ ,

there is some  $(x', y') \in U' \times V'$  such that  $F(x', y') \cap W = \emptyset$ . Let  $z \in F(x_0, y_0) \cap W$ . Using the regularity of Z, we can choose some open subset W' of W such that

$$z \in W' \subseteq \overline{W'} \subseteq W.$$

Since  $F^{y_0}$  is lower categorically quasicontinuous at  $x_0$ , there is a subset A of U of the second category such that

$$F(a, y_0) \cap W' \neq \emptyset, \quad a \in A.$$

Let  $\{V_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  be a countable base at  $y_0$ , define

$$A_n = \{ a \in A : V_n \subseteq F_a^-(W') \}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}.$$

Since for every  $x \in X$ , the function  $F_x$  is lower quasicontinuous at  $y_0 \in Y$ , we have  $A = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$ .

We will get into a contradiction by showing that each  $A_n$  has empty interior. Let n be a fixed positive integer and G be an arbitrary nonempty open subset of X. By our assumption,  $F(x_1, y_1) \cap W = \emptyset$  for some  $(x_1, y_1) \in G \times V_n$ . Therefore  $F(x_1, y_1) \subseteq Z \setminus \overline{W'}$ . Since  $F^{y_1}$  is upper horizontally quasicontinuous, there is some nonempty open subset G' of G and  $y_2 \in V_n$  such that  $F(G' \times \{y_2\}) \subseteq Z \setminus \overline{W'}$ . It follows that  $G' \cap A_n = \emptyset$ .

The following result follows immediately from Theorems 3.1 and 3.2.

**Theorem 3.3.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a space with countable base at  $y_0 \in Y$  and Z a second countable regular space. Let  $F: X \times Y \to C(Z)$  is an upper horizontally quasicontinuous function such that  $F_x: Y \to C(Z)$  is lower semicontinuous and  $F^y: X \to C(Z)$  is categorically lower quasicontinuous for each  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$ . Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is jointly lower semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

*Example* 3.1 ([19], Example 2). Let *E* be the set that was defined in Example 2.1. Define *F* :  $\mathbb{R}^2 \to \mathcal{C}(\mathbb{R})$  by

$$F(x,y) = \begin{cases} \{n\}, & (x,y) = (p_n, q_n) \in E \\ [0,\infty), & (x,y) \notin E. \end{cases}$$

One can easily check that all selection  $F_x$  and  $F^y$  are lower semicontinuous but F has no point of joint lower semicontinuity. Therefore the assumption of upper horizontal quasicontinuity of F in Theorem 3.3 is necessary.

**Theorem 3.4.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a topological space,  $y_0 \in Y$  and Z a developable space. Let  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  be symmetrically lower quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable and  $F^{y_0}$  be upper quasicontinuous. Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is jointly lower semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** Let  $\{\mathcal{G}_n\}$  be a development for Z. For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , let  $A_n$  be the set of all  $x \in X$  such that for some  $\mathcal{H}_n \subseteq \mathcal{G}_n$ ,  $F(x, y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}_n$  and  $(x, y_0) \in (F^-(W))^o$  for each  $W \in \mathcal{H}_n$  with  $(x, y_0) \in F^-(W)$ .

We will show that  $D_n = (A_n)^o$  is dense in X for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Take some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and let U be an arbitrary nonempty open subset of X. Let  $x \in U$  and  $\mathcal{H}_n$  be a finite subset of  $\mathcal{G}_n$  with  $F(x, y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}_n$ . Since  $F^{y_0}$  is upper quasicontinuous at x, there is a nonempty open subset U' of U such that  $F(t, y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}_n$  for each  $t \in U'$ . Let  $\mathcal{H}_n = \{W_1, \ldots, W_k\}$ . If  $U' \times \{y_0\} \cap F^-(W_1) = \emptyset$  put  $U_1 = U'$  and  $V_1 = Y$ . Otherwise, by symmetrical lower semicontinuity of F on  $U' \times \{y_0\}$ , we can choose a nonempty open subset  $U_1$  of U' and a neighborhood  $V_1$  of  $y_0$  such that  $U_1 \times V_1 \subseteq F^-(W)$ .

By applying this method k-times, we can find a nonempty open subsets  $U_i$  of U and a neighborhood  $V_i$  of  $y_0$  such that either  $U_i \times \{y_0\} \cap F^-(W_i) = \emptyset$  or  $U_i \times V_i \subseteq F^-(W_i)$ , where  $U_i \subseteq U_{i-1}$  and  $V_i \subseteq V_{i-1}$  for each  $1 < i \le k$ . Thus  $U_k \subseteq A_n$ . Since  $U_k$  is open,  $U_k \subseteq D_n$ . Therefore, each  $D_n$  is dense in X. Let  $D = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} D_n$ . Since X is a Baire space, D is dense in X. We will show that F is lower semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

Let  $x \in D$  and W be an open subset of Z with  $F(x, y_0) \cap W \neq \emptyset$ . Take some  $z \in F(x, y_0) \cap W$ . It follows from the definition that for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , there is some  $W_n \in \mathcal{H}_n \subseteq \mathcal{G}_n$  such that  $F(x, y_0) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{H}_n$  and  $z \in W_n$ . Since  $\{W_i\}$  is a base at z, there is some  $n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $W_{n_0} \subseteq W$ . Therefore

$$(x,y) \in \left(F^{-}(W_{n_0})\right)^o \subseteq \left(F^{-}(W)\right)^o$$

Hence F is jointly lower semicontinuous at  $(x, y_0)$ .

**Corollary 3.1.** Let X be a Baire space, Y a space with countable base at  $y_0 \in Y$  and let Z be a metric space. Let

(a)  $F: X \times Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is upper and lower horizontally quasicontinuous function,

(b)  $F_x: Y \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is upper and lower semicontinuous and

(c)  $F^y: X \to \mathcal{K}(Z)$  is categorically upper and lower quasicontinuous for each  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$ . Then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that F is jointly upper and lower semicontinuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** According to Theorems 2.1 and 3.4, there are dense  $G_{\delta}$  subsets  $D_1$  and  $D_2$  of X such that  $F|_{D_1 \times \{y_0\}}$  is jointly lower semicontinuous and  $F|_{D_2 \times \{y_0\}}$  is jointly upper semicontinuous. Since X is Baire,  $D = D_1 \cap D_2$  is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset of X and  $F|_{D \times \{y_0\}}$  is jointly upper and lower semicontinuous.

The following result follows immediately from Theorem 3.4.

**Corollary 3.2** ([21], Theorem 2). Let X be a Baire space, Y a topological space and Z a developable space. If  $f: X \times Y \to Z$  is symmetrically quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable, then, for each  $y_0 \in Y$ , there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that f is jointly continuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Corollary 3.3** ([15], Theorem 2). Let X be a Baire space, Y a topological space and Z a Moore space. If Y has a countable base in  $y_0 \in Y$  and  $f: X \times Y \to Z$  is a horizontally quasicontinuous function such that  $f^{y_0}$  is categorically quasicontinuous and  $f_x$  is continuous for each  $x \in X$ , then there is a dense  $G_{\delta}$  subset D of X such that f is jointly continuous at each point of  $D \times \{y_0\}$ .

**Proof.** By Theorem 3.2, f is symmetrically quasicontinuous with respect to the second variable at each point of  $X \times \{0\}$ . So that the result follows from Corollary 3.2.

## References

- Alleche B. Weakly developable and weakly k-developable spaces, and the Vietoris topology // Topology and Appl. 2001. – 111. – P. 3–19.
- Bouziad A., Troallic J. P. Lower quasicontinuity, joint continuity and related concepts // Topology and Appl. 2010. 157. – P. 2889–2894.
- Christensen J. P. R. Theorems of Namioka and R. E. Johnson type for upper semicontinuous and compact-valued mappings // Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. – 1982. – 6. – P. 649–655.
- Debs G. Points de continuitt d'une function separtment continue // Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 1986. 1, № 1. -P. 167-176.
- Ewert J. On points of lower and upper quasicontinuity of multivalued maps // Math. Slovaca. 1987. 37, № 3. -P. 255-261.
- 6. Ewert J., Lipski T. Quasi-continuous multivalued mappings // Math. Slovaca. 1983. 33. P. 69-74.

- 7. *Ewert J., Lipski T.* On *s*-continuous multivalued maps // Univ. u Novom Sadu. Zb. Rad. Prirod.-Mat. Fak. Ser. Mat. 1990. **20**, № 1. P. 167–183.
- 8. Ewert J., Neubrunn T. On quasicontinuous multivaled maps // Demonstr. Math. 1988. 21, № 3. P. 697–711.
- Fotiy O., Maslyuchenko O., Nesterenko V. Characterization of quasicontinuity of multifunctions of two variables // Math. Slovaca. – 2016. – 66, № 1. – P. 281–286.
- Giles J. R., Bartlett M. O. Modified continuity and generalisation of Michael's selection theorem // Set-Valued Anal. 1993. – 1. – P. 365–378.
- Hola L., Piotrowski Z. Set of continuity points of functions with values in generalized metric spaces // Tatra Mt. Math. Publ. - 2009. - 42. - P. 1-12.
- 12. Kempisty S. Sur les fonctions quasicontinues // Fund. Math. 1932. 19. P. 184-197.
- Kenderov P. S., Kortezov I., Moors W. B. Continuity points of quasicontinuous mappings // Topology and Appl. 2001. – 109. – P. 321–346.
- Maslyuchenko V. K., Filipchuk O. I. On the problem of discontinuity points for K<sub>h</sub>C-function on continuous curves // Nauk Visn. Chernivtsi Univ. Ser. Mat. – 2006. – Issue 314-315. – P. 217–221.
- 15. Maslyuchenko V. K., Mykhailyuk V. V., Filipchuk O. I. Joint continuity of K<sub>h</sub>C-functions with value in Moore spaces // Ukr. Math. J. 2008. **60**, № 11. P. 1803–1812.
- 16. *Maslyuchenko V. K., Mykhailyuk V. V., Shyshyna O. I.* Joint continuity of horizontally quasicontinuous mappings with values in  $\sigma$ -metrizable spaces // Mat. Met. Fiz.-Mekh. Polya. 2002. 45, No 1. P. 103–106.
- Mirmostafaee A. K. Norm continuity of quasicontinuous mappings into C<sub>p</sub>(X) and product spaces // Topology and Appl. – 2010. – 157. – P. 530–535.
- Mirmostafaee A. K. Topological games and strong quasicontinuity // Banach J. Math. Anal. 2011. 5, № 2. P. 131–137.
- 19. Neubrunn T. On quasicontinuity of multifunctions // Math. Slovaca. 1982. 32, № 2. P. 147-154.
- Piotrowski Z. On the theorems of Y. Mibu and G. Debs on separate continuity // Int. J. Math. and Math. Sci. 1996. 19, № 3. – P. 495–500.
- 21. Piotrowski Z. Separate and joint continuity in Baire groups // Tatra Mt. Math. Publ. 1998. 14. P. 109-116.
- 22. Popa V. Asupra unei decompuneri a cvasicontinitaii multifunctilor // St. Cerc. Mat. 1975. 27. P. 323 328.

Received 12.11.14, after revision - 08.02.17